

COMMENT ON “PHILOSOPHY OF MIND AS A PROBLEM OF PHILOSOPHY AND SCIENCE: REPRESENTATIVES OF THE WEST AND EAST”


Anton Vekluk

Khmelnytskyi National University, Khmelnytskyi 29000 – Ukraine.

 <https://orcid.org/0009-0001-0866-7980> |  an_vekluk@meta.ua

Commented Article reference: JALMAGAMBETOVA, Samal, GARIFOLLA, Yessim and NURYSHEVA, Gulzhykhan. Philosophy of mind as a problem of philosophy and science: representatives of the West and East. *Trans/Form/Ação: Unesp journal of philosophy, Marília*, v. 47, n. 2, “Feminine perspectives in philosophical thought”, e0240025, 2024.

Received: 31/07/2023 | Approved: 11/08/2023 | Published: 22/11/2023

 <https://doi.org/10.1590/0101-3173.2024.v47.n2.e0240037>



This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License.

COMMENT ON “PHILOSOPHY OF MIND AS A PROBLEM OF PHILOSOPHY AND SCIENCE: REPRESENTATIVES OF THE WEST AND EAST”

*Anton Vekluk*¹

Commented Article reference: JALMAGAMBETOVA, Samal, GARIFOLLA, Yessim and NURYSHEVA, Gulzhykhan. Philosophy of mind as a problem of philosophy and science: representatives of the West and East. **Trans/Form/Ação**: Unesp journal of philosophy, Marília, v. 47, n. 2, “Feminine perspectives in philosophical thought”, e0240025, 2024.

Anthropogenesis, specifically, the existence of the human species, is deeply woven into the matrix of evolutionary processes, which constantly actualizes the need to study its naturalistic components for centuries. One of the critical elements of this study is human consciousness, which was analyzed in the context of the philosophy of consciousness. This specific branch of philosophy significantly conditioned modern scientific views, offering many methodological approaches to substantiating the concept of personal rationality. This progress marked a significant shift from the traditional classical understanding, which assumed complex relationships between consciousness and the external environment, to a more modern approach involving reasoning based on aspects such as language and behavioral markers. However, despite these achievements, the mystery of the origin of human consciousness still remains unsolved.

According to Mabaquiao’s (2022) argument, the modern understanding of the philosophy of consciousness is based on the principles of physicalism, viewing most cognitive processes through the lens of scientific inquiry. However, there are several unsolved questions that concern the functioning of consciousness, and to which empirical sciences cannot provide

¹ Khmelnytskyi National University, Khmelnytskyi 29000 – Ukraine. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0001-0866-7980>. E-mail: an_vekluk@meta.ua.

comprehensive answers. As a result, scholars are considering alternative methodologies for the study of consciousness, including Buddhist theoretical concepts. In addition, a significant number of modern scientific developments in the context of the philosophy of consciousness discuss its interaction with related disciplines.

Despite the extensive academic database on the philosophy of consciousness, special attention is focused on the comparative philosophy of consciousness. This field of research examines the philosophical issues of consciousness, performing a comparative analysis of Western and Eastern academic discourses. Scholars examine two philosophical traditions, namely the Arab-Islamic and American schools, to reveal divergences in their interpretations of human consciousness. In this context, an analysis of Al-Farabi and Ibn Sina's philosophical views regarding the relationship between the soul and the body and cognitive abilities, as well as Dennett's physicalist concept regarding consciousness, is carried out.

An analytical review of the philosophy of consciousness opens up the perspectives of a broad theoretical construct, singling it out as a fundamental field of scientific research. This phenomenon correlates with the long-term task of revealing human consciousness, a task caused by the appearance of *Homo sapiens* as a distinctive existing object. Despite the plethora of interpretations derived from specific predicates, such as the respective scholars' individual experience or sociocultural context, a marked interdependence remains between all theories. This relationship extends to the Arab-Muslim philosophy of consciousness, which played a significant role in the development of European scholasticism. The prominent Arab-Muslim philosopher Al-Farabi is a leading figure in the philosophy of consciousness, given the breadth of his scientific research. Al-Farabi sought to create his distinctive theoretical framework, encompassing disciplines such as logic, physics, metaphysics and mathematics. However, his research was greatly influenced by modern scientific knowledge in the natural sciences, including such fields as physiology, medicine and physics. He considered the human essence as a dichotomous structure, where one element interacts with nature, and the other, with the heavenly and immaterial soul. Al-Farabi's epistemology is based on the interaction between human individuals and nature, in which the subject and the object of awareness are defined respectively. He presented his vision of the relationship between man and animal, arguing that people, like animals, are capable of feeling, but differ in consciousness. Such possession of consciousness defines the main difference between humans and other species. However, Al-Farabi denied that only the possession of consciousness is sufficient for human perfection; he recognized the acquisition of language and practical skills as necessary components.

Avicenna's intellectual contribution, also known as Ibn Sina, is significant for the study of Eastern philosophy. As a representative of the medieval world, he was an erudite researcher, presenting an innovative division of the philosophical discipline into the physical sphere, metaphysics and logic. His field of scientific interests was diverse, including the

study of the natural world, the methodology of cognition and cognitive processes as integral elements of existence. Ibn Sin shows a marked orientation towards materialism, actively seeking to develop principles of logical reasoning based on the laws of the physical world. He departed from the traditional idea of logic as an art, repositioning it as an independent scientific discipline. His scientific paradigm calls for discussion of the appropriateness of applying religious ideology to philosophical interpretations of existence. Ibn Sin puts forward the thesis that the world was not formed by direct divine creation, but through the process of emanation - a successive hierarchy of minds generated by the Almighty. He emphasizes the importance of the concept of eternal matter to the process of creation, while at the same time emphasizing the infinity that characterizes both God and the world through their mutual causality. The interaction between the individual's mental and physical aspects is recognized as inseparable, given that the construction of the physical shell fundamentally satisfies the need for a specific regulatory structure, which is a manifestation of the mental component. The mental component is presented as an entity that is exposed by higher cognitive processes into a material form to promote its ethical and cognitive perfection.

An analytical connection can be found between the philosophical concept of consciousness presented by Ibn Sina and Al-Farabi's doctrine. The differentiation between human beings and animals, where consciousness acts as a determining criterion, deserves special emphasis. Consciousness, in the context of this Arab-Muslim philosopher's teachings, is considered an intellectual potential aimed at solving problems. A person's ability to form abstract and logical conclusions based on empirically obtained information stems from this cognitive ability. Additionally, Ibn Sina makes a distinction between thinking processes and inner sensory experiences. He emphasizes that, although cognition conditioned by inner feelings is necessary, it does not guarantee deep understanding. Consequently, Ibn Sina separates intuitive understanding from the cognitive faculties and the brain, identifying it as an aspect of the soul. Thus, the philosophy of consciousness in the Arab-Muslim tradition, with a special emphasis on human cognitive abilities and religious culture as the basis of morality, has played an important role in the formation of modern socio-cultural contexts, including in regions like Kazakhstan.

Modern philosophy of mind in the Western tradition emphasizes technological advances that influence the acquisition of empirical data and contribute to the development of objective philosophical interpretations. Previously, scientific paradigms emphasized the interaction of humans and animals, but today the focus is on the interaction of humanity with artificial intelligence. Dennett, as a representative of the modern American philosophy of mind, promotes physicalism and a naturalistic interpretation of humanity. He criticizes dualism and emphasizes the importance of the study of consciousness using the natural sciences. In the context of consciousness, Dennett emphasizes the importance of the physical configuration of the brain and distinguishes it from the dualistic Arab-Muslim philosophy.

Dennett explains the functionality of consciousness in terms of many combined brain states that perform specific tasks. He draws parallels between human and computer activity, viewing consciousness as the result of operational behavior akin to computer programs.

The heterophenomenological approach, developed by Daniel Dennett and based on physicalism, offers an objective method of analyzing consciousness, although its plausibility is disputed due to the lack of consideration of subjective understanding. This concept marginalizes the individual nature of consciousness, asserting the impossibility of precise emotional quantification or qualification through external observation. Dennett also denies the existence of an inner self, dismissing it as a relic of classical metaphysics. Despite the caveats, this theory finds its supporters, emphasizing the persistence of physicalist principles in modern philosophical discourse. At the same time, John Searle, another influential figure in the field of the American philosophy of mind, expresses a critical attitude to the analogy between human consciousness and artificial intelligence. Opposing Dennett's position that exposes the human mind as a machine, Searle criticizes the authenticity and imitation of consciousness. He presents a hedonic experiment called *The Chinese Room*, demonstrating that the manipulation of symbols and algorithms that form the basis of computer functionality is not identical to consciousness or knowledge.

Given the qualitative differences in the views of consciousness in Western and Eastern philosophies, there is one important common element in their research. We are talking about an attempt to explain the work of consciousness in the context of natural sciences. Similar to Al-Farabi's efforts to interpret consciousness based on medical, biological and physical knowledge, Dennett assigns a central role in the future study of human consciousness to neurobiology. Therefore, a comprehensive study of the problem of philosophical consciousness in the context of science and philosophy has practical significance. It stimulates the search for a rational explanation of the difference between sociocultural spaces and acts as a unifying factor in the formation of a universal value paradigm of intercultural dialogue.

Jalmagambetova, Garifolla and Nuryшева (2024) conducted a comprehensive theoretical study to define the philosophy of consciousness as a problem at the intersection of philosophy and science. As part of the analysis, two philosophical traditions - Arab-Muslim and American - were investigated to understand the differences in their interpretations of human consciousness. The study shed light on the characteristics of the Arab-Muslim interpretation, including Al-Farabi's philosophy based on Aristotle's system and Ibn Sina's analysis of the relationship between the soul, body and mental faculties. The scholarly work also emphasized the importance of contemporary research within the American philosophical tradition, particularly Dennett's physicalist approach to consciousness. The authors presented their interpretation of the American thinker's philosophy, using the method of belief

criticism, and examined Searle’s empirical research on human consciousness in comparison with computer programs.

REFERENCES

JALMAGAMBETOVA, Samal, GARIFOLLA, Yessim and NURYSHEVA, Gulzhykhan. Philosophy of mind as a problem of philosophy and science: representatives of the West and East. **Trans/Form/Ação**: Unesp journal of philosophy, Marília, v. 47, n. 2, “Feminine perspectives in philosophical thought”, e0240025, 2024.

MABAQUIAO, N. The Buddhist turn in contemporary philosophy of mind. **Philosophia**, v. 23, n. 1, p. 83-102, 2022.