



# COMMENT ON “CONCEPTS OF WHAT IS ALLOWED AND FORBIDDEN IN ISLAM THROUGH THE ANALYSIS OF IBN TAYMIYYAH’S FATWA”


*Yaroslava Gutor*

Sumy State University, Sumy 40000 – Ukraine.

 <https://orcid.org/0009-0002-8142-689X> |  [phd\\_yagutor@ukr.net](mailto:phd_yagutor@ukr.net)

Commented Article: MAEVSKAYA, Lyudmila B.; AGA, Khaisam Muhammad Concepts of what is allowed and forbidden in Islam through the analysis of Ibn Taymiyyah’s fatwa. *Trans/Form/Ação: Unesp journal of philosophy, Marília*, v. 47, n. 2, “Feminine perspectives in philosophical thought”, e0240016, 2024.

Received: 31/07/2023 | Approved: 10/08/2023 | Published: 13/11/2024

 <https://doi.org/10.1590/0101-3173.2024.v47.n2.e0240023>



This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License.

## COMMENT ON “CONCEPTS OF WHAT IS ALLOWED AND FORBIDDEN IN ISLAM THROUGH THE ANALYSIS OF IBN TAYMIYYAH’S FATWA”

*Yaroslava Gutor*<sup>1</sup>

Commented Article: MAEVSKAYA, Lyudmila B.; AGA, Khaisam Muhammad Concepts of what is allowed and forbidden in Islam through the analysis of Ibn Taymiyyah’s fatwa. **Trans/Form/Ação**: Unesp journal of philosophy, Marília, v. 47, n. 2, “Feminine perspectives in philosophical thought”, e0240016, 2024.

An analytical study of the eminent Islamic scholar Ibn Taymiyyah’s theories regarding the binary opposition of haram (forbidden) and halal (permissible) in the context of the Islamic faith continues to provide significant insights into Islamic law, ethical postulates, cultural self-identification and current polemical debates. The central goal of this scientific work is a thorough analysis of Ibn Taymiyyah’s literary sources and the extraction of guiding principles that play an important role in the Islamic community. Given the status of Islam as a global religion that affects the lives of millions, a deep understanding of its basic doctrines, such as halal and haram, is required. Thus, a detailed study of Ibn Taymiyyah’s works is extremely relevant and appropriate.

Nesprava (2017) emphasizes the priority importance of one of the key aspects of Ibn Taymiyyah’s theological concept - the postulate of an authentic understanding of Islam, which, according to his conclusions, was characteristic of early Muslims, but was later distorted by subsequent generations. Taymiyyah’s writings appeal to the need to revitalize this original understanding of Islam, arguing that such a movement in the direction of truth is in full accordance with the fundamental tenets of the faith. It can equip Muslims with the necessary tools to improve both their social and personal lives, as well as to overcome spiritual and political challenges. According to Taymiyyah, these challenges should be seen

---

<sup>1</sup> Sumy State University, Sumy 40000 – Ukraine. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0002-8142-689X>. E-mail: [phd\\_yagutor@ukr.net](mailto:phd_yagutor@ukr.net).

as a punishment for departing from the original Islam, while recognizing that a return to the original understanding of Islam is a necessary stage in the process of improving the general condition.

The significance of Ibn Taymiyyah's fatwas, which regulate permissible and impermissible actions according to his interpretation in Muslim society, is indisputable. Analysis of compliance with these directives illustrates the often radical, and sometimes even fanatical, interpretation of Islamic norms by these scholars. It is important to emphasize that the radicalism of his views reflects the current state of crisis in the Muslim community. Ibn Taymiyyah argued that the correct understanding and application of what is permissible (halal) and what is prohibited (haram) in Islam are obligatory for individuals and society as a whole to maintain righteousness, justice and moral integrity. Undoubtedly, his interpretation of the concepts of "legal" and "illegal" was formed under the influence of his personal beliefs.

In his scientific work, Ibn Taymiyyah actively used Islamic canonical works, such as the Koran, Sunnah, Hadiths and others, taking into account the translations of ancient Greek and Roman philosophy, to clarify his religious concepts. In his work "Majmoo' Al-Fatawa", he states that unwavering adherence to Imam's views may lead to punishment if the person does not renounce his accusations and perform penance. His statements are aimed not only at Muslims but also at adherents of other religious denominations. According to his beliefs, the Wahhabis, who take his teachings as the basis of their doctrine, and those who refuse to accept his anthropomorphic interpretation of the faith, justify the acceptability of repressive measures. Ibn Taymiyyah also considers a person who denies the visibility of Allah in the afterlife to be an apostate. He declares that those who deny the Qur'an and do not believe in Allah are infidels who must perform penance or suffer capital punishment. This fatwa was primarily directed against the Jahmites and the Mu'tazilites, who rejected the concept of a visible Allah. He also uses the most ancient Muslim scholars' authority to confirm that anyone who claims that the Qur'an is a created entity must perform penance or be subject to capital punishment if he does not perform penance. This fatwa was issued as a means of countering the Mu'tazilites. However, his fatwas seem to hinder interfaith dialogue, as they propose some religious doctrines that oppose Alawites, Druze, Shiites, Mu'tazilites, Jahmites, and Christians.

One of the most discussed and controversial theological statements is the topic of "triple divorce", presented in the 33rd volume of "Majmoo' Al-Fatawa". The issue of "triple divorce" has long been a subject of controversy within Islamic jurisprudence, and Ibn Taymiyyah's position in this context led to his incarceration and the subsequent ban on issuing religious instructions, or fatwas. Ibn Taymiyyah, in common with many Islamic scholars, presented his treatise on Tawassul, which reflects the practice of turning to Allah through an intermediary. He argued that Tawassul is acceptable only if recourse to an intermediary is

by the principles laid down in the Islamic texts - the Qur’an, the Sunnah and the scholars’ consensus (Ijma). Ibn Taymiyyah was highly critical of the traditional understanding of tawassul in Islam, which allowed addressing saints or graves, denying the compatibility of such tawassul practices with Islamic texts. In his speeches, he emphasized that requests or prayers addressed to the dead violate Islamic guidelines and resemble pagan rites. He called on the believers to abandon the practice of turning to God with requests in the name of the deceased or a person with high status.

Ibn Taymiyyah’s innovative addition to the panorama of knowledge has its roots in his emphasis on the enormous role of nutrition in the context of spiritual and physical advancement. He emphasized the importance of purity and balance in the dietary regime, defining nutrition as an independent component of the Islamic ethical code. Quoting Ibn Taymiyyah, a deliberate and healthy food choice has a beneficial effect on the individual’s physical health, emotional state and spiritual progress. Hence, from his perspective, the function of nutrition goes beyond mere physical nourishment and plays a key role in a practising Muslim believer’s existence. A detailed study of Ibn Taymiyyah’s speeches, in particular, the 35th volume of the treatise “Majmoo’ Al-Fatawa”, offers an in-depth analysis of the norms governing the slaughtering process. In the 22nd volume of the same document, situations where the consumption of prohibited products, caused by a critical state of hunger or the lack of alternative sources of nutrition, are characteristic of human existence. Under such circumstances, Ibn Taymiyyah points to the urgency of consulting with scholars who are familiar with the four main schools of Islamic jurisprudence (madhabs) before starting to consume meat of a prohibited kind. These discussions highlight Ibn Taymiyyah’s responsibility for dietary matters and his emphasis on the fulfilment of Islamic principles. Key among these directives is the avoidance of pork and pork-based products, alcohol and alcoholic beverages, and substances suspected to be of porcine origin, such as gelatin. In addition, it is necessary to guarantee the observance of Islamic slaughtering rituals during the production of meat and meat products, as well as the assurance of the healthy quality of feed, such as fruits and vegetables, consumed by animals.

Ibn Taymiyyah developed a doctrine based on the global organization of economic relations, in which the provisions of Islamic dogma are the guiding principle. He believed that the Islamic State is an integrated structure that includes political, administrative and economic directions. In the context of Islamic states, its economic paradigm is based on the principles of regulation of economic relations, known as Hisbah, and a regulatory body called Muhtasib. Mukhtasib fulfils a role that goes far beyond the standard monitoring of counterfeit goods, measuring instruments, weights and illegitimate market participants. This role also involves monitoring individuals who disrespect the rites of prayer and fasting. Ibn Taymiyyah was highly critical of the interest rate system that was widely used in various areas of Islamic economics, including lending, insurance and investment. He emphasized the

need for state intervention to ensure the well-being of the population's vulnerable and poor sections. He also emphasized the importance of creating an economic structure that ensures the fair distribution of wealth, promotes social progress and stimulates the growth of the national economy.

Ibn Taymiyyah emphasized the importance of implementing the principles of honesty, truthfulness and respect for others in the context of interpersonal relationships. He put forward a thesis about the need for the fair use of material resources, emphasizing their purpose for noble purposes and improving the conditions of the population's poor and disadvantaged sections. Regarding issues of conflict and peacekeeping, Ibn Taymiyyah firmly believed in the doctrine of defensive war, strongly condemning aggressive offensive policies. He supported efforts to spread peace and avoid any disputes that could lead to violence and human casualties.

In considering a certain person's philosophical doctrine, its assessment of the historical and cultural context becomes extremely significant. This approach is especially essential for understanding the principles that define his worldview and views. The researched person's philosophical opinion is largely determined by socio-political conditions that prevailed in his era. Among the scientist Ibn Taymiyyah's works, his fatwas occupy a particularly important place, which is important for the formation of Muslims' religious and cultural identity around the world. His explanations of the concepts of "haram" and "halal" contribute to a deeper understanding of Islamic law and its prohibitions. Despite the differences of opinion regarding Ibn Taymiyyah's ideologies in the Muslim world, his contribution to the development and culture of Islam cannot be underestimated. A critical analysis of his works remains relevant even in modern times, and a study of his fatwas is essential for a deeper understanding of Islam and its position in the contemporary global context. Thus, the impressive research carried out by the authors provides a unique opportunity to delve into Ibn Taymiyyah's philosophy and religious heritage, to reveal the influence of his thoughts on the formation of Islamic culture and to understand the significance of his scientific legacy in the modern world. This is our comments for Maevskaya and Aga (2024).

## REFERENCES

MAEVSKAYA, Lyudmila B.; AGA, Khaisam Muhammad Concepts of what is allowed and forbidden in Islam through the analysis of Ibn Taymiyyah's fatwa. **Trans/Form/Ação**: Unesp journal of philosophy, Marília, v. 47, n. 2, "Feminine perspectives in philosophical thought", e0240016, 2024.

NESPRAVA, M.V. **Religious and philosophical views of Ibn Taymiyyah**. Dnipro: Dnipropetrovsk State University of Internal Affairs, 2017.